

archivist responsible for the records created by the PCSP and the Department of Energy, Mines and Resources, the federal department through which it reports, this writer has had the opportunity to see at first hand the records generated by this agency. The range and quality of the work performed by the PCSP is certainly worthy of mention and it is surprising how few publications refer to the scientific achievements of the organization. The value of this book lies in its skillful blending of administrative history, individual vignettes in the form of oral history, particularly interesting photographs of the scientists in the field, along with the esthetically pleasing portraits of the Arctic landscape. One of the weaknesses of the book is that it is not long enough. More information could have been offered about recent administrative changes or about outside influences on programme development. These flaws aside, the book combines the beauty and danger of the Arctic with enough facts to satisfy those who seek to increase their knowledge. Even the nationalists can be heartened by the concrete efforts that at least one group is making to demonstrate Canadian sovereignty in the North.

**Doug Whyte**

Federal Archives Division  
Public Archives of Canada

**The War Against the Seals: A History of the North American Seal Fishery.** BRITON COOPER BUSCH. Kingston and Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1985. xviii, 374 p. illus. maps. ISBN 0-7735-0578-4 \$29.95.

The anti-sealing campaign of recent years has attracted more than its fair share of actresses and other charlatans. Briton Cooper Busch, an American professor of history with impressive credentials in British Imperial history, is neither of these. However, this book's selective use of sources calls into question the legitimacy of the anti-sealing campaign. Even though the sub-title is *A History of the North American Seal Fishery*, this study is not about the history of sealing in North American waters. Rather it only deals with sealing by the white citizens (with two notable exceptions) of the United States and British North America. This is most certainly a direct result of the author's use of a limited range of primary sources.

From the beginning one is disturbed by the very structure of the work. The book is divided into five parts. Part One: "Prologue," consists of one chapter, "Boston Men and Stonington Sealers 1783-1812," which deals with early American sealing. Part Two: "The Swilers of Newfoundland" discusses in two chapters sealing in Newfoundland from 1790 to 1916. Part Three: "The 'Sea Bears' of the Pribilofs" examines certain aspects of sealing in the Bering Sea from the American purchase of Alaska in 1867 down to 1911. The hunting of sea elephants and other lesser species is the subject of Part Four: "The Wilder Shores." Finally, in Part Five: "Epilogue," the author gives us an all too brief outline of the recent controversy. It should be noted here that the publisher has not provided adequate maps. They are much too small and do not improve the reader's geographical knowledge of such little known places as the Prince Edward Islands in the Indian Ocean or any of the other obscure sealing grounds mentioned in the book. More importantly the bibliography only lists published sources. The unpublished primary sources can only be found in the author's footnotes. This makes it very difficult to check the entire range of the author's sources.

By far the most convincing parts of Busch's work are those written from original sources. The best chapter in the book is "Boston Men and Stonington Sealers." The author has an affinity for these early Yankee adventurers who were enterprising capitalists *par excellence*! One good voyage could make a captain wealthy and a fortune could be had in only two or three voyages. In those days sealers had only to worry about bad weather, rocky shores, and other human competitors. These indomitable men sailed far afield to such inhospitable havens as South Georgia and Kerguelen Island. Busch discusses all of these out of the way places with knowledge and an apparent understanding of the primary sources. Certainly for early nineteenth-century sealing, the author has a seeming fondness for the frontiersmen of the high seas.

Busch's understanding of his sources continues when he examines American sealing on the Pribilof Islands during the latter part of the nineteenth century. To the author's credit the aboriginal people's involvement in the seal hunt is given extended analysis. This laudable effort however does not extend to the natives of the east coast or the Arctic. The book does cover the well-known diplomatic ground of the Bering Sea controversy, and Busch gives a workmanlike description of the Canadian pelagic sealers.

While those portions of *The War Against the Seals* that deal with early American sealing and the Bering Sea seal fishery are reasonably complete, the same cannot be said of Part Two: "The Swilers of Newfoundland." The two chapters that outline the development of sealing in Newfoundland from 1790 to 1916 are written almost exclusively from secondary sources. While there can be little argument about the quality of some of the scholarship cited (notably that of Shannon Ryan and Chesley Sanger), using other people's work is not the same as research into the original sources. This portion of the book is one step removed from primary sources and it shows. For example, while the truck system is described, the standard of living of outport Newfoundlanders is not discussed. Indeed, the author spends more time examining the living standards of the Pribilof Islanders than he does that of the swilers. Newfoundlanders did not go swiling as a passage to manhood as Busch asserts but for plain and simple economic reasons. They desperately needed the money. This, in fact, is illustrated by the point made by Busch that the increasing out-migration from Newfoundland during the latter part of the nineteenth century coincided with a decline in the seal fishery.

Original sources for the study of swiling do exist but this work shows little evidence that they were used in its preparation. There is no mention of such useful series as Colonial Office 194, Newfoundland, Original Correspondence, or C.O. 199, Newfoundland, Miscellanea (this series includes the colony's Blue Books) at the Public Records Office and on microfilm at the Public Archives of Canada. Other sources ignored at the PAC include the Sir John Thomas Duckworth Collection and the Lester-Garland Family papers, to name just two. No attempt seems to have been made to use the Hudson's Bay Company records at the Provincial Archives of Manitoba yet the Company's long standing connections with the old Newfoundland firm of Job Brothers are well known. The archives on the Rock itself are poorly served. Many collections at the Provincial Archives of Newfoundland and Labrador are missed altogether, including the records of Slade and Sons, an extensive collection of business papers, and the Benjamin Lister papers. None of the numerous business collections at the PANL nor the Maritime History Group archives appear to have been consulted.

In the epilogue, Busch attempts to bring his history up to date with an examination of the recent controversy. The author adds little to the debate although he does downplay

the economic importance of the harvest to Newfoundland. The author is willing to consider that the motivations of the swilers are more than just economic while on the other hand he accepts the altruistic pronouncements of the anti-sealers at face value. In conclusion, it may be said that *The War Against the Seals* is good imperialist history. The American portions of the book are written from an acceptable mixture of primary and secondary sources. The same cannot be said for the remainder of the book. Newfoundlanders have in the past suffered from a lack of imperial concern; in this book they suffer from imperialistic scholarship. This new master undertakes to write their history from secondary sources alone. If the use of primary sources is a necessary component of the writing of American history, then the same must be true for Newfoundland history. By this test *The War Against the Seals* is a failure.

**M. Stephen Salmon**  
Manuscript Division  
Public Archives of Canada

**Frank H. Underhill: Intellectual Provocateur.** R. DOUGLAS FRANCIS. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1986. x, 217 p. ISBN 0-8020-2545-5 \$27.50.

In *Frank Underhill: Intellectual Provocateur*, Douglas Francis has produced a well-written and balanced account of one of twentieth-century Canada's most interesting and significant figures. Unfortunately the book fails to explore fully all the logical possibilities of its subject.

Frank Underhill taught history at Canadian universities. As this study makes clear, however, his role as an academic scholar was consistently overshadowed by those of teacher, political commentator, activist, and general intellectual gadfly. One can in fact pose the fundamental question whether Underhill may be considered to have been an historian at all, in that he lacked the ability to synthesize which characterizes the craft; as W.L. Morton noted, "the best of his mind was analytical and critical," being dominated by "the radical's propensity to fragment." Underhill himself commented that "the only way I know how to make myself useful is to be constantly critical." In this area, he had few peers.

Following a brilliant student career at the University of Toronto and Oxford, Underhill taught at the University of Saskatchewan (where he felt like "a nonentity at the edge of nowhere") before moving to the University of Toronto in 1927. For the next forty-one years he was to devote himself to improving the state of Canadian politics, through his teaching, his provocative speeches and writings (particularly his editorials in *Canadian Forum*), and through his own active participation in political life.

His most noticeable contribution, of course, was as what has been called the "busy midwife" to the birth of the CCF. A founder and first president of the leftist League for Social Reconstruction, Underhill looked on the Great Depression as the means whereby a fundamental right/left realignment of Canadian politics might result. Although he had initially felt that the LSR might serve simply as the provider of ideas to a revitalized and genuinely progressive Liberal party, he quickly became involved with the CCF, drafting the party manifesto which was adopted at Regina in the summer of 1933 (typically, he missed the deadline — the draft had been due in January). This involvement with the